

**NATIONAL BOARD  
INSPECTION CODE  
COMMITTEE**

*MINUTES*

---

*Meeting of NBIC Sub-Group on Inspection and Repair of Locomotive Boilers  
9 & 10 November 2009  
Meeting at Williams, AZ.*

*These minutes are subject to approval and are for committee use only.  
They are not to be duplicated or quoted for other than committee use.*

The National Board of Boiler & Pressure Vessel Inspectors  
1055 Crupper Avenue  
Columbus, Ohio 43229-1183  
Phone: (614) 888-8320  
FAX: (614) 847-1828

**Meeting convened at:** 9 am, 9 November 2009

## Minutes

### Adoption of Agenda

**Motion** to adopt agenda – Jackson, 2<sup>nd</sup> Griner

**Voted** – 9 affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstaining, 0 not voting

**Announcements** – John Rimmasch issue regarding interpretation of PFT-24, PG-46. Upshot is that John will submit a code (ASME) change request.

### Minutes of previous meeting

**Motion** to approve minutes – Lee, 2<sup>nd</sup> Jackson

**Voted** - 9 affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstaining, 0 not voting

**Errata** – none

**NBIC negative votes** - none

**Technical Library Update** – none

### Old Business

**Discussion and Progress Report:** a general discussion ensued in the ESC meeting regarding staybolt and flue tools; It was generally agreed that emphasis should be on the application and not the tools; Staybolt material and application was discussed and it was decided that this may be a subject that can be included in the NBIC; Secretary will put it in the NBIC agenda; This item was not officially opened so the secretary is removing it from the ESC agenda; nothing new as of 11/08; Dick Stone will make an initial draft for 11/09 meeting, as of 3/09; no discussion 11/09

**Discussion and Progress Report:** Boiler tube seal welding; NB philosophy has changed to allow more explanatory items in the NBIC; to that end it was agreed to include the text from the current ASME Section I on flue application; a submission will be prepared for the 11/07 meeting; nothing new as of 11/08; Dick Stone will draft an initial document for 11/09 meeting, as of 3/09; no discussion 11/09

**Discussion and Progress Report:** FRA inspector class. None scheduled for 2005. Nothing new as of 11/05; Rob Castiglione indicated the interest of FRA for recurring training for its inspectors as of 3/06; no report as of 11/06; discussion and recommendations for future training as of 3/07; class set for week of 4 May 2008 as of 11/07; nothing new as of 3/08; Nothing new as of 11/08; Nothing new as of 3/09; none scheduled for 2010 as of 11/09;

**#09-1001 Discussion and Progress Report:** Evaporation rates for steam locomotive boilers  
*Table S1.6 Minimum Pounds of Steam per Hour per Square Foot of Heating Surface for Steam Locomotive Boiler Safety Relief Valve Capacity*  
*Firebox heating surface* – hand fired 8, stoker fired 10, oil fired 14  
*Flue heating surface* (area of waterside of flues) – hand fired 5, stoker fired 7, oil fired 8  
*Superheater heating surface* (area of pressure side of superheater elements in locomotives with no valve between the boiler and the superheaters) – hand fired 5, stoker fired 7, oil fired 8;

Insert this as a new Inspection Zone under Part 2, S1.6 as action #08-xxxx; **This is NOT included in the “Draft 2009 Addendum Cycle A” , with comments due by 8 December 2008;**

**Action taken at 3/08 meeting: Item was resubmitted; Not on January 2009 NBIC committee agenda; Robin will make sure this gets a number as of 3/09;**  
**Motion** to close this item – Conrad, 2<sup>nd</sup> Butler

**Voted** - 9 affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstaining, 0 not voting

**Discussion and Progress Report:** Recommended practice issues – items to be considered;  
Prioritization;

Results of committee and guest poll:

1. Unqualified repair personnel & organizations – Yuill, McCormack
2. Standards for boiler surveys - Butler
3. Wrong materials used – all applications - Jackson
4. Riveting practices – fit up, prep, eccentric holes & tapers - Stone
5. Welding seams and rivets to stop leaks - Griner
6. Head of flexible staybolt welded to rusted off remnant of old sleeve - Stone
7. Understanding of stresses that cause staybolt failure - Moedinger
8. Material documentation - Jackson
9. Taking boiler UT readings only at the minimum requirement - Butler
10. Welding – weld caps to sleeves - Franzen
11. Welding by unqualified personnel - Griner
12. Full penetration welded bolt countersink prep - Janssen
13. Improper threaded staybolt application – overdriving, oil on threads, no bucking - Moedinger
14. Improper flue application – over rolling, incorrect type expanders – Conrad, Lee
15. Seal welding over oily surfaces - Janssen
16. Extent of pad welding – too much - Griner
17. Materials and skills not up to any standard - Jackson

Nothing new as of 11/08; assigned tasks at 3/09 meeting; nothing new as of 11/09;

**#09-1002 Discussion and Progress Report:** Insert in the flue section of Part 3, S1.2.9.8, the following from BLW Standard Practice sheet 1-14A – *All flues smaller than 3”OD shall be rolled and beaded or rolled and seal welded on the firebox end, and at least one in ten at the front flue sheet end. All flues 3” OD and larger shall be rolled and beaded or rolled and seal welded at both ends and all adjacent flues smaller than 3” OD that are within the large flue pack shall be rolled and beaded or rolled and seal welded at both ends. At least one in ten of the remaining flues smaller than 3” OD shall be beaded or seal welded on the front flue sheet, in addition to rolling. Where less than all flues are seal welded or beaded on the front flue sheet, those seal welded or beaded shall be distributed as evenly as practicable throughout the flue pack. This shall be considered a repair.* Wording has been modified from 1-14A to avoid using “tubes and flues” to differentiate sizes. No discussion as of 3/08, submitted at 11/08 meeting; **Not on January 2009 NBIC committee agenda; Robin will assign a number;** Submitted submit this item to be located in Part 3, S1.2.9.8, action item #09-xxxx at 3/09 meeting **Motion** to close this item – Reetz, 2<sup>nd</sup> Griner

**Voted** - 9 affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstaining, 0 not voting

**#09-1003 Discussion and Progress Report:** Add SA-307 Grade A or B to the materials list in new row titled “Bolts and Studs”, under the application column in table located in Part 3, S1.1.3.1; No discussion as of 3/08; item submitted at 11/08 meeting;

Added this item to table in Part 3, S1.1.3.1, action item #09-xxxx at 3/09 meeting;

**Motion** to close this item – Reetz, 2<sup>nd</sup> Lee

**Voted** - 9 affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstaining, 0 not voting

**#09-1004 Discussion and Progress Report:** Clarify Section S1.2.11 regarding whether RT and PWHT exemption applies to stayed shell as well as firebox, as intended in the 1952 Locomotive code.  
**ASME Section III,**

*L-113, Welded Joints (a) Fusion welding may be used in boilers in cases where the stress or load is carried by other construction which conform to the requirements of the Code and where the safety of the structure is not dependent upon the strength of the weld, provided the material is permitted to be welded, or as otherwise specified in this paragraph. Welding done under these provisions need not be stress-relieved or radiographed.*

*The welding procedure and welding operator shall have been qualified under the applicable provisions of Section IX of the Code for the material, type of weld, and position in which the welding is to be done.*

**Action taken at 11/08 meeting:** Change the title of Part 3, S1.2.11.2 from “*Firebox Patches*” to “*Stayed Area Patches*”; Change wording in Part 3, S1.2.11.2, b) to read “*Patches are to be flush type, using full penetration welds. If the load on the patch is carried by other forms of construction, such as braces, staybolts, rivets, or flues, radiographic examination of the welds is not required.*”

**Item submitted at 11/08 meeting; Not on January 2009 NBIC committee agenda**

Submitted this item as action item #09-xxxx – Moedinger, 2<sup>nd</sup> Reetz

**Motion** to close this item – Reetz, 2<sup>nd</sup> Conrad

**Voted** - 9 affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstaining, 0 not voting

**#09-1005 Discussion and Progress Report:** Maximum diameter and out of roundness of flue holes  
Insert the following action item #09-xxxx in Part 3, S1.2.11.6, new e) - *Maximum diameter of flue holes shall be 1/4” greater than the diameter of the flue. Holes shall be made round if they equal or exceed 1/8” out of round. See Part 3, S1.2.9.7.*

Submitted this item as action item #09-xxxx at 3/09 meeting

**Motion** to close this item – Reetz, 2<sup>nd</sup> Lee

**Voted** - 9 affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstaining, 0 not voting

**Discussion and Progress Report:** NBIC adopt FRA inspection regimen. This topic was briefly discussed as of 11/08; No discussion at 3/09 meeting;

**Motion** to adopt by reference 49 CFR, Part 230 – Moedinger, 2<sup>nd</sup> Jackson

**Voted** - 0 affirmative, 9 negative, 0 abstaining, 0 not voting

**Discussion and Progress Report:** Operating procedures for NBIC Steam Locomotive subgroup adopted as presented at 3/09 meeting; no discussion at 11/09 meeting;

**Discussion and Progress Report:** Insert cross reference to Part 3, S1.2.11.6 in ferrule section, Part 3, S1.2.9.7 after ferrule section appears in NBIC;

**Motion** to close this item – Reetz, 2<sup>nd</sup> Griner

**Voted** - 9 affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstaining, 0 not voting

## **New Business**

**Motion** to open item to discuss scope for locomotive and historical boilers in NBIC – Reetz, 2<sup>nd</sup> Jackson

**Voted** - 9 affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstaining, 0 not voting

**Motion** to amend Part 3, Section 6 as follows: Griner 2<sup>nd</sup> Butler:

- Drop the word “Firetube” from the title
- Drop “General Requirements” and replace with “Scope”
- S1.1 Scope: This supplement is provided to cover repairs and alterations to all steam locomotive boilers of welded or riveted construction.
- S1.1.1 – This section remains the same
- S1.1.2 Application: It is the intent of this supplement that all steam locomotive boilers meet the requirements of the FRA rules for steam locomotive boilers, 49 CFR, Part 230, Steam Locomotive Inspection and Maintenance Standards.

**Voted** - 9 affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstaining, 0 not voting

**Discussion and Progress Report:** From the NBIC July meeting -The action item number is NB10-0102 it references Part 3 S1.2.10 and here is the background information that I received: S1.2.10 a) states prior to repairing cracks, the plate shall be examined for defects. What are the additional minimum requirements for examination methods? MT or PT? Anything else?

**Motion** to delete last two sentences of S1.2.10, a) – Griner, 2<sup>nd</sup> Conrad

**Voted** - 9 affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstaining, 0 not voting

**Discussion and Progress Report:** Main committee wants reference to safety relief valves in the inspection section and the repair section. Bob Reetz will inform the main committee that we are working on this issue.

**Discussion and Progress Report:** Flue application procedures – Stone

**Discussion and Progress Report:** Rivets – Stone

**Discussion and Progress Report:** Ferrules – Stone

**Discussion and Progress Report:** Staybolts – Stone

**Discussion and Progress Report:** Cass boiler/threaded staybolts – Moedinger

**Motion** to close this item – Conrad, 2<sup>nd</sup> Janssen

**Voted** - 9 affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstaining, 0 not voting

**Discussion and Progress Report:** This task group has been requested by ASME to write a locomotive construction code for ASME Section I; ASME 08-1760; NB10-1501

1. ASME Scope
2. General
3. Materials
4. Fabrication
5. NDE
6. Testing
7. Documentation

An announcement was drafted and reviewed:

### **ANNOUNCEMENT**

For release to: *TrainLine*, and selected websites: trainsmag.com; rypn.org; railwayage.com; progressiverailroading.com; ARM, NBIC website

A new Part for inclusion in Section I covering construction of new steam locomotive boilers is to be considered by the Code Committee of American Society of Mechanical Engineers (ASME).

The ASME has asked the National Board Inspection Code Committee (NBIC), Subgroup on Locomotive Boilers to begin the drafting process. **The Subgroup needs your input!**

To initiate a first draft, *prior* to ASME's formal process, we need the first series of your comments and suggestions by **31 January, 2010**. Comments must be exclusive to *new construction* of locomotive boilers, either riveted or welded (both types of construction will be treated in the new Part). Also our mandate does not include miniature boilers as defined in ASME Boiler Code, Section I, Part PMB.

So, please write or Email comments and suggestions to TRAIN, PO Box 1245, Chama, NM 87520-1245; [train@valornet.com](mailto:train@valornet.com) ,  
**to be received not later than 31 January 2010.** (email is preferred)

Once a draft is submitted formally under ASME procedures, the new Part will be published, and there will be opportunity for public comment.

**Guest questions** - none

**Next meeting** – 12-14 April 2010, at Strasburg, PA

**Adjournment** – 9:45 am, Tuesday, November 10, 2009

**Motion** - to adjourn – Lee, 2<sup>nd</sup> Butler

**Voted** - 8 affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstaining, 0 not voting

**NBIC Subgroup & Engineering Standards Committee Members**

(M) = Member (MN) = Member non-voting

8 December 2009

- (M) **Steven M. Butler** Email [greenchili@tds.net](mailto:greenchili@tds.net)  
PO Box 1251  
Alamosa, CO 81101 cell 262 853-9662
- (M) **David Conrad, Chief Mechanical Officer (vice chair ESC)** Email [jdconrad@snet.net](mailto:jdconrad@snet.net)  
Valley Railroad Co.  
PO Box 452 (860) 614-9777 cell  
Essex, CT 06426 (860) 767-2021 FAX (860) 767-0104
- (M) **Robert Franzen** Email [ssoa2001@aol.com](mailto:ssoa2001@aol.com)  
Steam Services of America  
55 John Allman Lane  
Sylva, NC 28779 cell 828 226-5214 fax 828 631-2903 Work 828 631-2901
- (M) **David Griner (vice chair NB, treasurer ESC)** [dgriner@arizonamechanicalengineering.com](mailto:dgriner@arizonamechanicalengineering.com)  
8450 Wethersfield  
Peoria, AZ 85381 (307) 421-7304(cell)
- (M) **Steve Jackson, Chief Mechanical Officer D&SNG** Email [sjackson@durangotrain.com](mailto:sjackson@durangotrain.com)  
479 Main Avenue  
Durango, CO 81301 (c) (970) 946-5106 (h) (970) 247-1491 (w) (970) 385-8850(w) FAX (970) 259-3570
- (M) **Matthew A. Janssen** Email [mjanssen@monida.us](mailto:mjanssen@monida.us)  
PO Box 1627  
Sandpoint, ID 83864 (208)304-3454 cell
- (M) **Stephen Lee, Manager, Train Operating Practices & Mgr.-Steam Locomotive Operations**  
Union Pacific Railroad  
1800 Westland Road E-mail [SALee@up.com](mailto:SALee@up.com)  
Cheyenne, WY 82001 (307) 778-3214 FAX (307) 778-3310 cell (307) 631-3058
- (M) **Doyle McCormack, Engineer** Email [doyle396@comcast.net](mailto:doyle396@comcast.net)  
616 Roosevelt Street  
Oregon City, OR 97045 (503) 655-7999 (h) Cell (503) 442-7645
- (M) **Linn Moedinger, VPCMO ( ESC, NB subgroup Secretary), Strasburg Rail Road**  
PO Box 96 (717) 575-4478 cell E-mail [linnw@supernet.com](mailto:linnw@supernet.com)  
Strasburg, PA 17579 (717) 464-2041 (h) (717) 687-8421 (w) FAX (717) 687-6194
- (MN) **George L. Scerbo, FRA, Railroad Safety Specialist, MP&E**  
West Building, Mail Stop 25  
1200 New Jersey Ave., SE Email [george.scerbo@DOT.GOV](mailto:george.scerbo@DOT.GOV)  
Washington, DC 20590 (202) 493-6249(w) (202) 230-9593 cell (FAX) (202) 493-6230
- (MN) **Robert Schueler**  
National Board of Boiler Inspectors E-mail [schuelerrl@asme.org](mailto:schuelerrl@asme.org)  
1055 Crupper Avenue E-mail [rschueler@nationalboard.org](mailto:rschueler@nationalboard.org)  
Columbus, OH 43229 (614) 888-8320 (w) (FAX) (614) 847-1828 (Direct FAX) (815) 371-0133
- (M) **Richard Stone, ALSTOM**  
692 Grange Road Email [richard.b.stone@power.alstom.com](mailto:richard.b.stone@power.alstom.com)  
Teaneck, NJ 07666 (201) 287-0374 (201) 370-3517 cell (FAX) (201) 836-1230
- Chair **Bill Withuhn, (ESC, NB Chair) Smithsonian Institution** E-mail [wwithuhn@aol.com](mailto:wwithuhn@aol.com)  
6311 Barr=s Lane (301) 503-8355 cell  
Lanham, MD 20706-2841 (301) 459-6047 (h) (202) 633-1919 (w) FAX (202) 357-4256
- (M) **Robert Yuill, Steam Locomotive Consultant, Historic Machinery Services**  
PO Box 856 E-mail [hismachry@windstream.net](mailto:hismachry@windstream.net)  
Springville, AL 35146 (256) 538-6938 FAX is the same # (205) 908-0482 CELL
- (M) **Robert Reetz, Chief Boiler Inspector** E-mail [breetz@nd.gov](mailto:breetz@nd.gov)  
North Dakota Insurance Dept., Boiler Inspection Dept. Phone 701 328-9607  
1701 S. 12<sup>th</sup> Street FAX 701 328-9610  
Bismarck, ND 58504-6644